

"Any attempt to fabricate a non-existent cultural practice in defense of a totally abhorrent and illegal act is unconscionable."

— Thomas Kaulukukui Sr.



HAWAII CLIPPING SERVICE

P.O. Box 10242
Honolulu, Hawaii 96816
PHONE: 734-8124
Victoria Custer
Eliese Stroup

HONOLULU ADVERTISER

APR 8 1989

J E

Early Hawaiians didn't eat seals, OHA leader says

By Suzanne Tswei

Advertiser Staff Writer

The Office of Hawaiian Affairs, concerned that native Hawaiians' rights may be used in defending a Kauai man accused of killing an endangered Hawaiian monk seal, has written to the man's attorney advising him that ancient Hawaiians did not hunt or eat seals.

The office yesterday publicized the letter, written by OHA Chairman Thomas Kaulukukui Sr., to Deputy Federal Public Defender Hayden Aluli, which said "any attempt to fabricate a non-existent cultural practice in defense of a totally abhorrent and illegal act is unconscionable."

Aluli is representing Daniel Kaneholani, 32, a Hawaiian fisherman accused of killing a female Hawaiian monk seal in March. Kaneholani, of Anahola Bay, pleaded not guilty to a misdemeanor charge of violating

the federal Endangered Species Act and is free on bail pending trial May 28.

Aluli could not be reached for comment yesterday. He had said he would try to find out whether hunting seals was a Hawaiian custom and try to seek an exemption from the federal act for his client.

Aluli had said Hawaiians may have a constitutional right to follow their ancestors' customs because other native American groups have won exemptions. For example, Indians are allowed to hunt bald eagles for certain religious and ceremonial purposes, he said.

However, the letter said, "there is no evidence that pre-contact Hawaiians ever hunted or ate seals." The letter cited three experts who said seals were never considered a traditional food source by the ancient Hawaiians.

Advertiser file photo

tion. In ancient Hawaii, any one violating a kapu faced severe and certain punishment," the letter said.

The letter also noted that OHA's board of trustees does not intend to prejudge Kaneholani's guilt or innocence. Authorities suspect Kaneholani killed and butchered a Hawaiian monk seal on March 13 when he was seen leaving the area where the seal was later found. The seal was killed by a bullet between the eyes as it lay on a beach.

The seal was dragged from the shore and decapitated. Its back was cut open and two long sections of meat were removed from the loin area. Kaneholani offered some seal meat to others, authorities said.

The slaying of an endangered Hawaiian monk seal is a misdemeanor punishable by a year in federal prison and a \$25,000 fine. ■

A modern-day kapu has been established to prevent their ex-

Edith McKenzie, a Hawaiian

Food defense shot down in seal killing

An attempt to use the claim that a native Hawaiian on Hawaiian Homes land has the right to kill an endangered animal for food to justify the slaughter of a monk seal at Anahola in March, was shot down by a federal magistrate in Honolulu Monday.

Daniel "Ghuna" Kaneholani, 31, who lives on Anahola Beach, was charged with violation of the federal Endangered Species Act for his alleged role in the shooting of the seal.

The federal law doesn't prohibit Kaneholani from hunting for monk seals because he's a native Hawaiian, hunting on Hawaiian land, federal Deputy Public Defender Hayden Aluli argued for his client.

Aluli argued that Kaneholani had rights similar to those of native American Indians to hunt and fish on their reservations.

He produced references from an historical book that says ships

commissioned by the Kingdom of Hawaii in the early 19th century hunted for seals and brought back their skins.

That argument was countered by Assistant U.S. Attorney John Peyton, who said that according to a monk seal expert with the National Marine Fisheries,

William Gilmarin, the seals mentioned in the book weren't Hawaiian monk seals, and they weren't hunted in Hawaii but in waters of the Northwest Pacific and as far away as Hudson Bay.

Aluli cited an account of a seal found at Hilo Bay in 1900 and eaten by native Hawaiians, who were "curious" about the animal of which they knew nothing.

Magistrate Daral Conklin told Aluli that the idea that Hawaiians were curious about the seal seemed to contradict his claim that native Hawaiians hunted the mammal.

Conklin also said there is no

evidence that native Hawaiians hunted for monk seals or that they had a right to kill them.

And that even if he were to compare Hawaiian Homes land with an Indian reservation, the federal law would still apply because this violation involves "taking from the sea," not from the land and the rivers.

Aluli agreed he didn't have any concrete evidence that native Hawaiians hunted monk seals but he wanted to establish that they have a right to take them from the sea.

Conklin said that when the federal law was considered, everyone had a chance to argue for exemptions but both the Territory and the State of Hawaii have always some of the strongest advocates for fish and game preservation.

The magistrate said that when

the Territory and the state

passed its own laws, it didn't

exempt Hawaiians.

Along with Conklin's decision not to allow this argument, he denied Aluli's motion to dismiss the misdemeanor charge and a motion to suppress evidence in the case.

Aluli had claimed that Samuel Kaleiohi who turned the seal meat he found in his sister's (Mrs. Reis) freezer, was a "government" agent who got the meat without a warrant. Peyton pointed out the meat was relinquished voluntarily and Kaleiohi was just a concerned citizen, and the judge agreed.

Aluli had withdrawn a second motion to suppress evidence, prior to Monday's hearing. That "evidence" involved hair found in the back of Kaneholani's pick-up truck. The decks have now been cleared for a trial in federal court in Honolulu Oct. 23, and the request for a trial by jury

(Please turn to page 3)

★ hop seal ★

(Continued from Page 1)

hasn't been changed.

If Kaneholani is found guilty, the maximum sentence would be two years in jail and a fine of \$100,000.

Kaneholani is free on \$3,000 bail posted by the Hawaiian Legal Defense Fund.

The dead seal was found by Kahala Point. It was a 9-foot, 800-pound adult female who appeared to have given birth a

few months before. The remains of the seal were discovered by Gene Whitham, National Marine Fisheries Agent, several days after it had been shot between the eyes and hauled into a stand of ironwood trees. Its head was about 100 feet away from its body and a six foot strip of meat had been taken from its carcass.

It is believed this was one of three Hawaiian monk seals who periodically rest and sun themselves on Kauai's beaches. Experts say there are only 1,500 to 2,000 Hawaiian monk seals left in the world.



Volume 6, No. 5

"The Living Water of OHA"

Mei (May) 1989

No Cultural Evidence Found Experts Say Hawaiians Did Not Hunt Or Eat Seals

By Ed Michelman
Public Information Officer

The Office of Hawaiian Affairs says there is no evidence to link early Hawaiians with the practice of hunting or eating seals. One of OHA's main goals as a state agency is to preserve and promote Hawaiian culture. This is why OHA trustees expressed serious concerns following reports that assistant federal public defender Hayeden Aluli is considering a "native Hawaiian rights" defense in the case of Daniel Kanehohani, who is accused of killing an endangered Hawaiian monk seal.

An April 6, 1989 letter to Aluli, signed by OHA Chairman Thomas Kauihukui, Sr., says in part: "The Board, of course, in no way intends to pre-judge the guilt or innocence of Mr. Kanehohani. However, any attempt to fabricate a non-existent cultural practice in defense of a totally abhorrent and illegal act is unconscionable."

"There is no evidence that pre-contact Hawaiians ever hunted or ate seals. Researchers such as Edith McKenzie and Puakea Nogelmeier say there are only passing references to Hawaiian seals, indicating that contact with humans was rare and that seals were never considered a traditional food source."

This contention is supported by Alan Ziegler, former head of the Bishop Museum's vertebrate zoology department. Ziegler states that no Hawaiian seal bones or bone fragments have ever been uncovered in any archaeological site in Hawaii.

The linguistic evidence also indicates that seals were uncommon creatures in Hawaii prior to 1778 just as they are today. The Hawaiian names for seal are "aloholokauaua", "kila", "hulu", and

"sia". "Kila" and "sia" are derived from the English name for the animal. "Aloholokauaua" is a descriptive name which means "the dog which travels the rough seas". This indicates that seals were so rare in Hawaii, there was no common name for the animal. The word, "hulu" means fur and probably was introduced by early whalers who

traveled to areas such as Alaska where fur seals were hunted. Hawaiian monk seals are on the federal endangered species list for a very good reason. It is estimated only 1,000 to 2,000 of them are left on earth. A modern day kapu has been established to prevent their extinction.



Hawaiian monk seal.

Photo courtesy of Pacific Missile Range Facility, Kauai.

Right to kill seals rejected

Charge against Kaneholani stands

By Ken Kobayashi
Advertiser County Writer

A federal magistrate yesterday rejected a claim that native Hawaiians have a right to kill the endangered Hawaiian monk seal for food on Hawaiian Home lands.

Federal Magistrate Daral Conklin denied a request to dismiss the misdemeanor charge against Daniel P. Kaneholani, 31, who is accused of violating the federal Endangered Species Act by slaying a monk seal on Kauai in March.

Federal Deputy Public Defender Hayden Aluli argued that the federal law doesn't prohibit a native Hawaiian, such as Kaneholani, from hunting for monk seals on Hawaiian Home lands at Anahola, Kauai.

As a resident of that land, Kaneholani retains rights under ancient Hawaiian law granted to the occupiers of the Hawaiian Home lands, which were set aside by federal law for the benefit of native Hawaiians, Aluli said.

Aluli argued that those rights are similar to the rights of native Americans to their own lands, which "didn't

say they applied to everybody except Hawaiians."

Aluli produced a references from a historical book that ships commissioned by the Kingdom of Hawaii in the early 19th century hunted for seals and brought back seal skins. But Assistant U.S. Attorney John Peyton said that according to William Gilmartin, a monk seal expert with the National Marine Fisheries Service, those seals were not Hawaiian monk seals and were hunted in waters of the Northwest Pacific and as far away as Hudson Bay.

Aluli also cited an account of a seal found at Hilo Bay in 1900 and eaten by native Hawaiians, who were "curious about the animal of which they knew nothing."

Conklin said the account seemed to contradict Aluli's assertion that native Hawaiians hunted the mammals. Aluli conceded that there is "a lack of concrete evidence," but said he wanted to establish that native Hawaiians did have "the right to take (the seals) from the sea."

Kaneholani's trial is scheduled for Oct. 23.

In Court



can Indians to hunt and fish on their reservations.

Conklin, however, said there is no evidence that native Hawaiians hunted for monk seals or that they had a right to kill those mammals.

And he said even if he were to consider Hawaiian Home lands similar to an Indian reservation, the federal law would still apply because the case involves "taking from the sea," and not the land.

The magistrate said when the federal law was considered, everyone had a chance to argue for exemptions, but the Territory of Hawaii and, later, the state of Hawaii were among the strongest advocates for fish and game preservation.

He said the Territory and state passed their own laws, which "didn't

say they applied to everybody except Hawaiians." Aluli produced a references from a historical book that ships commissioned by the Kingdom of Hawaii in the early 19th century hunted for seals and brought back seal skins. But Assistant U.S. Attorney John Peyton said that according to William Gilmartin, a monk seal expert with the National Marine Fisheries Service, those seals were not Hawaiian monk seals and were hunted in waters of the Northwest Pacific and as far away as Hudson Bay. Aluli also cited an account of a seal found at Hilo Bay in 1900 and eaten by native Hawaiians, who were "curious about the animal of which they knew nothing."

Conklin said the account seemed to contradict Aluli's assertion that native Hawaiians hunted the mammals. Aluli conceded that there is "a lack of concrete evidence," but said he wanted to establish that native Hawaiians did have "the right to take (the seals) from the sea."

Kaneholani's trial is scheduled for Oct. 23.

Man pleads guilty to seal slaying

by Georgia Mossman

An Anahola man pleaded guilty to violating the federal Endangered Species Act by shooting and slaughtering an Hawaiian Monk Seal on Kauai's coast before his trial was to begin in federal court last Monday. Daniel "Ghina" Kaneholani, attorney for the defendant, said word that his client was willing to enter a guilty plea. Part of the plea agreement was that a weapons charge against Kaneholani would be dismissed, in exchange for his cooperation in further investigation of the crime, according to U.S. District Attorney John Peyton.

Witnesses said Kaneholani had asked two people if he could

borrow their guns to shoot the seal, and they both said no. But he did get a gun from someone, and he also borrowed rope, "and we want to know who he got them from and if he had help dragging an animal that size from the ocean and across the sand to where the carcass was found," Peyton said.

Kaneholani is free on \$3,000 bail to await sentencing on the misdemeanor Feb. 5. The charge carries a maximum penalty of \$25,000 and one year in jail.

In earlier court hearings, Kaneholani's attorney, federal Deputy Defender Hayden Alui, claimed Kaneholani, as a Native Hawaiian, had a right to kill the adult seal, who had been shot between the eyes and dragged up the beach to a stand of ironwood trees where it was beheaded and

fish on their reservations. But the seal, and they both said no. But judge had overruled these arguments.

Recently Kaneholani told The Garden Island that he was just following his culture, following in his tutu-man's footsteps with his fishing. That it was white man's culture that made this illegal.

National Marine Fisheries agent Gene Williamson, who called to Kauai in March with a report that one of the endangered seals had been murdered at Kahala Point near Anahola Beach, few days earlier. Investigation led him to the discovery of a decomposing carcass of a female adult seal, who had been shot between the eyes and dragged up the beach to a stand of ironwood trees where it was beheaded and

(See seal slaying on Page 3)

a meat was stripped from its back.

Kaneholani gave some meat to Evelyn Reis, to keep in her freezer, and her brother, Samuel "Buff" Kaleohi called federal authorities. Prior to Kaneholani's pleading guilty, he told The Garden Island that the meat he gave Reis was goat meat, but it was seal meat that Kaleohi gave to authorities.

The entire community, including many Hawaiians, was outraged by the killing of one of the three seals that had been seen regularly sunbathing on Kauai's beaches. And various Hawaiian organizations spoke out against the killing, saying ancient Hawaiians didn't kill seals or eat

their meat.

Whitman said the seal was nine feet long and he estimated its weight at about 500 pounds. A veterinarian examined the carcass and felt the seal had given birth a few months before. Word went out for people to keep their eyes peeled for a pup whose life would be at risk because of its mother's death, but there was no sighting of the pup.

Over Labor Day weekend, William G. Gilmarin, director of the Marine Mammals & Endangered Species program in Honolulu, with assistance from friends, campers and area fishermen, removed a fish hook from the jaw of a year-old seal on Kauai's south shore. Gilmarin said this seal, which was tagged shortly after it was born, was the first reported monachal seal birth in the Hawaiian Islands in about 10 years. This was the second attempt to remove the hook and this time the seal was found sleeping on the beach near where she was the taking of turtles and the harassment of dolphins, whales

that the seal that was munched gave birth to, Gilmarin could only say it was about the right age. The Hawaiian monk seal was listed as an endangered species in 1976 and it's estimated that there are only about 1,500 of these seals still in existence. To assist in the recovery of the monk seal population, the program Gilmarin is heading, MMES, began a "Head Start" project in 1986 to increase first-year survival of female monk seal pups at Kure Atoll, where the population is heading, MMES.

"Graduate" females in the program are now giving birth and the number of seals is expected to continue to increase.

Ten seals were born at Kure this year, compared to only one in 1986, Gilmarin said.

Kaneholani is the first person to be prosecuted for killing a seal under the federal Endangered Species Act involving the taking of turtles and the harassment of dolphins, whales

As to whether this is the pup and albatrosses, Peyton said

★ seal slaying ★

(Continued from Page 1)

HAWAII CHAMBERS OF COMMERCE
70, Box 10012
Honolulu, HI 96814
Phone: (808) 534-5124
Vicente Carter, Elena Stewart
GARDEN ISLE

Seal killer gets a year — and banishment

By Ken Kobayashi
Advertiser Courts Writer

A Kauai man was sentenced yesterday to a year in jail for killing an endangered Hawaiian monk seal last year, but was allowed to remain free provided he lives on Oahu pending an appeal.

Daniel P. Kaneholani, who is claiming that the federal endangered species laws doesn't apply to him as a native Hawaiian, was sentenced by federal Magistrate Daral Conklin.

The hearing lasted nearly five hours, first focusing on whether Kaneholani should get the one-year sentence requested by federal prosecutors, and then on whether he should remain free pending an appeal that could run longer than his jail term.

Kaneholani, 31, pleaded guilty to shooting the female seal at Anahola, Kauai, in March last year on condition that he could appeal the rejection of his claims that he should be exempt from the federal law as a native Hawaiian hunting for food on Hawaiian Homes Lands.

Kaneholani said he was "wrong" and promised not to kill any other monk seals, but said he lives "off the land" and feels he has rights as a native Hawaiian.

Conklin, however, went along with Assistant U.S. Attorney John Peyton's request for the maximum jail term for the misdemeanor. The magistrate said Kaneholani killed the seal with "a bullet between its eyes" and used the meat for a barbecue at a "beach party."

He also cited Kaneholani's

criminal record of assault, harassment and reckless endangering, and said the loss of the mature female seal was significant.

William Gilmartin of the National Marine Fisheries Service estimated that there are only 350 mature females among the 1,700 Hawaiian monk seals, most of whom are found in the Northwest Hawaiian Islands.

Despite Peyton's strenuous objections, Conklin then ruled that Kaneholani could remain free on bail. The magistrate, however, said he could not allow Kaneholani to remain free unless he moved from Kauai where he has had problems with his family and others at Anahola.

That brought strenuous objections from federal Deputy Public Defender Hayden Aluli, who argued that the magistrate was "banishing (Kaneholani) from his family, his home, his kids and his lifestyle."

Conklin, however, said there was no other way Kaneholani could remain free.

The magistrate said Kaneholani must leave Kauai by noon Monday and live on Oahu, the only island, other than Kauai, where the federal probation office can regularly test Kaneholani for alcohol.

The magistrate ordered Kaneholani to refrain from consuming alcohol and drugs and to submit to alcohol and drug tests as directed by the probation office.

Aluli later said Kaneholani will abide by the conditions, but said they will discuss whether it may be better for him to start serving his jail sentence now.

A3
3-3-90 THA